# MINUTES OF THE MEETING

## AGENDA

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Opening of the meeting</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Election of the Presider</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Adoption of the agenda</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Approval of the minutes of the 50th meeting</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Review of Dolphin Mortality Limits for 2011 and 2012</td>
<td>IRP-51-05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Review of AIDCP List of Qualified Captains</td>
<td>IRP-51-06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Review of observer data</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Review of actions by Parties on possible infractions reported by the IRP:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. Actions taken since report at the 50th meeting</td>
<td>IRP-51-08a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Status review of special cases</td>
<td>IRP-51-08b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Report of the Permanent Working Group on Tuna Tracking</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Report of the Working Group to promote and publicize the AIDCP Dolphin Safe Tuna Certification System</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Other business</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Recommendations for the Meeting of the Parties</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>Place and date of next meeting</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Adjournment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## APPENDIX

1. List of attendees

The 51st Meeting of the International Review Panel was held in La Jolla, California (USA) on 19 June 2012. The attendees are listed in Appendix 1.

1. **Opening of the meeting**

Dr. Guillermo Compeán, Director of the Inter-American Tropical Tuna Commission (IATTC), opened the meeting.

2. **Election of the Presider**

Mr. William Jacobson, of the United States, was elected to chair the meeting.
3. Adoption of the agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes, but item 10, report of the Working Group to Promote and Publicize the AIDCP Dolphin Safe Tuna Certification System, was postponed in order to be addressed later once the group had met.

4. Approval of the minutes of the 50th meeting

The minutes of the 50th meeting of the Panel were approved without modifications.

5. Review of Dolphin Mortality Limits (DMLs) for 2011 and 2012

The Secretariat summarized the situation with respect to the allocation, reallocation, and utilization of Dolphin Mortality Limits (DMLs) in 2011, described in Document IRP-51-05. It was noted that no vessel had exceeded its DML in 2011, and also that, as of 21 May 2012, the same was true of DMLs assigned for 2011.

6. Review of AIDCP List of Qualified Captains

The Secretariat presented Document IRP-51-06, Changes to the AIDCP List of Qualified Captains, which updates the changes that have taken place between 14 September 2011 and 21 May 2012. During that period 13 captains were added, and none reinstated or removed.

7. Review of observer data

The Secretariat presented the data reported by observers of the On-Board Observer Program relating to possible infractions received and processed by the Secretariat since the Panel’s previous meeting. The Panel discussed those cases that were not automatically referred to the pertinent Parties, and forwarded those identified as possible infractions of the AIDCP to the responsible government for investigation and possible sanction.

The following cases, identified by the corresponding trip number, were discussed:

2011-485. Interference with the observer's work. The observer was denied access to drinking water and he complained about the hygienic conditions on the vessel. The vessel in question usually operates in the Western Pacific. The observer did not report it as a possible infraction, but the flag State is already investigating the case.

The Panel agreed to refer this case to the relevant Party for investigation.

2011-609. Interference with the observer's work. The observer was offered US$ 5,000 to not report fishing by the vessel in the high seas closure area. Moreover, he reported multiple instances of verbal abuse by the fishing captain.

The Panel agreed to refer this case to the relevant Party for investigation.

2011-734 and 2011-774. In both cases, the vessels involved began to fish on dolphins before their respective flag States had granted them a DML. These cases will be referred to the Parties not as possible infractions by their vessels, but to remind the governments of the importance of advising their fleets promptly of their DML allocations.

2012-510. This case does not involve the national or IATTC observer programs. No AIDCP-related information was received from the program responsible for assigning the observer to this trip.

The Panel agreed that the case should be reported to the relevant government for investigation, and that it should be monitored as a special case.

The United States said that, in order maintain the high standards and integrity of the AIDCP, this case should be closely monitored. Should the vessel be one of its flag vessels, the United States would investigate the case and inform the Secretariat as soon as the investigation was complete. Mexico stated...
that the differences between the IATTC and other relevant programs should be documented and, if it was concluded that the other programs did not meet the standards of the AIDCP, it might be necessary to review the memorandum of understanding on the cross endorsement of observers with the entity involved.

2012-106. The vessel did not have dolphin protection equipment, despite the fact that it had been allocated a DML. In spite of that, it made a set on dolphins with the sole purpose of being able to retain its DML, as was acknowledged by the captain in his written comments.

Venezuela pointed out that governments may request DMLs only for vessels that have all the dolphin protection equipment required by the AIDCP. The Panel agreed to refer this case to the relevant Party for investigation.

8. Review of actions by Parties on possible infractions reported by the IRP

a. Actions taken since report at the 50th meeting

The Secretariat presented Document IRP-51-08a, Responses to six types of possible infractions identified during the 50th meeting. He reported that there were two cases of observer harassment, in one of which the government determined that there was no infraction, and in the other there was no response. There were also two cases of night sets, to which there had not yet been any response from the government.

b. Status review of special cases

The Secretariat presented Document IRP-50-08b, Summary of special cases monitored by the Panel, in which the case of a vessel with a DML that made a set on tunas associated with dolphins despite not having the dolphin protection and rescue equipment required for vessels with DMLs was presented. The captain of the vessel documented on the record of the set that its objective was only to keep the DML, not to capture dolphins.

The Panel agreed to maintain this as a special case and refer it to the Party for investigation.

9. Report of the Permanent Working Group on Tuna Tracking

Dr. Luis Fleischer, of Mexico, who chaired the meeting of the Working Group, presented his report, indicating that it recommended that the Panel review the reports by governments on the actions taken in cases of falsified Tuna Tracking Forms (TTFs), but that, given the low frequency of such cases, guidelines for dealing with them are not necessary.

Mexico clarified that this does not mean that these cases should not be addressed.

10. Report of the Working Group to promote and publicize the AIDCP Dolphin Safe Tuna Certification System

The report would be presented once the group had met.

11. Other business

No other business was presented.

12. Recommendations for the Meeting of the Parties

The Panel agreed on the following recommendations for the Meeting of the Parties:

1. Review the standards of other observer programs, to ensure that AIDCP standards are maintained in the EPO, and if appropriate, consider reviewing any agreements on mutual recognition of observers with other entities.

2. That information on the actions taken by Parties regarding cases of forged TTFs be reviewed by the IRP.
13. Place and date of next meeting
The next meeting of the Panel will be held in October 2012, on the occasion of the meetings of the AIDCP.

14. Adjournment
The meeting was adjourned at 3:30 p.m. on 18 June 2012.

Appendix 1.

ATTENDEES – ASISTENTES

BOLIVIA

ALFREDO FLORES
Ministerio de Defensa
pescamar@mindef.gob.bo

GUSTAVO LARA
Ministerio de Ambiente y Desarrollo Sostenible
Gustavolara7@gmail.com

COLOMBIA

ENRIQUE DE LA VEGA
Programa Nacional de Observadores de Colombia
edelavega@pesclimpia.org

JIMMY MARTÍNEZ
Subsecretaría de Recursos Pesqueros
Jimmy.martinez@pesca.gob.ec

LUÍS TORRES
Subsecretaría de Recursos Pesqueros
luis.torres@pesca.gob.ec

RAMON MONTAÑO
Subsecretaría de Recursos Pesqueros
rmontano@pesca.gob.ec

ECUADOR

LUIS FLEISCHER
Instituto Nacional de la Pesca
mariogaguilars@aol.com

ENRIQUE DE LA VEGA
Programa Nacional de Observadores de Colombia
edelavega@pesclimpia.org

JIMMY MARTÍNEZ
Subsecretaría de Recursos Pesqueros
Jimmy.martinez@pesca.gob.ec

LUÍS TORRES
Subsecretaría de Recursos Pesqueros
luis.torres@pesca.gob.ec

RAMON MONTAÑO
Subsecretaría de Recursos Pesqueros
rmontano@pesca.gob.ec

ESTADOS UNIDOS DE AMÉRICA - UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

DAVID HOGAN
U.S. Department of State
hogandf@state.gov

ADAM BLOOMQUIST
U.S. Department of State
blooomquist@state.gov

WILLIAM JACOBSON
U.S. Department of State
Bill.jacobson@noaa.gov

MICHAEL HENDRICK
NOAA/Fisheries Southwest Regional
Michael.hendrick@noaa.gov

JEREMY RUSIN
NOAA/National Marine Fisheries Service
jeremy.rusin@noaa.gov

MARTINA SAGAPOLU
NOAA/National Marine Fisheries Service
Martina.sagapolu@noaa.gov

BRADLEY WILEY
NOAA/National Marine Fisheries Service
brad.wiley@noaa.gov

MICHÉLE ZETWO
NOAA/National Marine Fisheries Service
Michelle.zetwo@noaa.gov

ED STOCKWELL
U.S. Commissioner
edstockwell@insigntbb.com

GUILLERMO GOMEZ
Gomez-Hall Associates
gomezhall@gmail.com

BRADLEY WILEY
NOAA/National Marine Fisheries Service
brad.wiley@noaa.gov

MICHÉLE ZETWO
NOAA/National Marine Fisheries Service
Michelle.zetwo@noaa.gov

ED STOCKWELL
U.S. Commissioner
edstockwell@insigntbb.com

GUILLERMO GOMEZ
Gomez-Hall Associates
gomezhall@gmail.com

MÉXICO

MICHEL DREYFUS
Instituto Nacional de la Pesca
dreyfus@cieces.mx

HUMBERTO ROBLES
PNAAPD

MÉXICO

MICHEL DREYFUS
Instituto Nacional de la Pesca
dreyfus@cieces.mx

HUMBERTO ROBLES
PNAAPD
NICARAGUA

JULIO GUEVARA
INATUN
juliocgp@gmail.com

PANAMÁ

RAÚL DELGADO
ARAP/Autoridad de los Recursos Acuáticos de Panamá
rdelgado@arap.gob.pa

PERÚ

GLADYS CÁRDENAS
Instituto del Mar del Perú
gcardenas@imarpe.gob.pe

UNIÓN EUROPEA - EUROPEAN UNION

MARCO D’AMBROSIO
European Commission
marco.dambrosio@ec.europa.eu

JAVIER ARÍZ
Instituto Español de Oceanografía
javier.ariz@ca.ieo.es

VENEZUELA

ALVIN DELGADO
PNOV/FUNDATUN
adelgadopnov@cantv.net

INDUSTRIA ATUNERA - TUNA INDUSTRY

LILLO MANISCALCHI
Avatun
lilomaniscalchi@yahoo.com

RAFAEL TRUJILLO
Cámara Nacional de Pesquería
direjec@camaradepesqueria.com

ORGANIZACIONES NO GUBERNAMENTALES - NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS

CRISTOBEL BLOCK
Humane Society of the U.S.
kblock@hsus.org

REBECCA REGNERY
Humane Society International
rregnery@hsi.org

SECRETARÍA - SECRETARIAT

GUILLERMO COMPEÁN, Director
Director

gcompean@iattc.org
mlopez@iattc.org

JEFF MORGAN
jmorgan@iattc.org

JEAN-FRANÇOIS PULVENIS
jpulvenis@iattc.org

ENRIQUE UREÑA
eurena@iattc.org

NICHOLAS WEBB
nwebb@iattc.org